

---

# West Coast Publishing

---

## Criminal Justice Reform 2020-21 Negative

**Edited by Jim Hanson**

Researchers

Alex McVey, Angie Tinker, Eric Robinson, Jonathan Shane, Kinny Torre, Matt Stannard,  
Serena Fitzgerald, Shelby Pryor, Tyler Durbin, William James Taylor

Thanks for using our Policy, LD, Public Forum, and Extemp Materials.

**Please don't share this material with anyone outside  
of your school**

including via print, email, dropbox, google drive, the web, etc.

*We're a small non-profit; please help us continue to provide our products.*

**Contact us at [jim@wcdebate.com](mailto:jim@wcdebate.com)**

[www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)

## NEGATIVE EVIDENCE FILE INTRO

# CRIMINAL JUSTICE 2020-2021

## WEST COAST NEGATIVE

**Resolved: The United States federal government should enact substantial criminal justice reform in the United States in one or more of the following: forensic science, policing, sentencing.**

### Finding Arguments in this File

Use the table of contents on the next pages to find the evidence you need or the navigation bar on the left. We have tried to make the table of contents as easy to use as possible. You'll find scenario/impacts, affirmatives, disadvantages, counterplans, and kritiks listed alphabetically in their categories.

### Using the Arguments in this File

We encourage you to be familiar with the evidence you use. Highlight (underline) the key lines you will use in the evidence. Cut evidence from our files, incorporate your and others' research and make new files. File the evidence so that you can easily retrieve it when you need it in debate rounds. Practice reading the evidence out-loud; Practice applying the arguments to your opponents' positions; Practice defending your evidence in rebuttal speeches.

### Use West Coast Evidence as a Beginning

We hope you enjoy our evidence files and find them useful. In saying this, we want to make a strong statement that we make when we coach and that we believe is vitally important to your success: DO NOT USE THIS EVIDENCE AS A SUBSTITUTE FOR YOUR OWN RESEARCH. Instead, let it serve as a beginning. Let it inform you of important arguments, of how to tag and organize your arguments, and to offer citations for further research. Don't stagnate in these files--build upon them by doing your own research for updates, new strategies, and arguments that specifically apply to your opponents. In doing so, you'll use our evidence to become a better debater.

### Copying and Sharing West Coast Evidence?

Our policy gives you the freedom to use our evidence for educational purposes without violating our hard work.

- You may print and copy this evidence for those on your team.
- **You may not electronically share nor distribute this evidence with anyone other than those on your team unless you very substantially change each page of material that you share.**

For unusual situations, you can e-mail us at [jim@wcdebate.com](mailto:jim@wcdebate.com) and seek our consent.

### Ordering West Coast Materials

1. Visit the West Coast Web Page at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)
2. E-mail us at [jim@wcdebate.com](mailto:jim@wcdebate.com)
3. Fax us at 877-781-5058

Copyright 2020. West Coast Publishing. All Rights Reserved.

**Visit our web page!**  
**[www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)**

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

NEGATIVE EVIDENCE FILE INTRO ..... 2

TABLE OF CONTENTS..... 3

Resolved: The United States federal government should enact substantial criminal justice reform in the United States in one or more of the following: forensic science, policing, sentencing..... 13

Topic Analysis Neg Arguments ..... 14

Definitions ..... 16

Criminal Justice Reform..... 17

Forensic Science ..... 19

Policing ..... 21

Sentencing..... 23

Topicality Shells..... 25

CJR =/= Rehabilitation ..... 26

CJR =/= Decreasing Non-Violent Incarceration Rates ..... 27

Forensic Science =/= Cyber Evidence ..... 28

Forensic Science Reform= Legal Reform ..... 29

Policing = Changing Culture AND Increasing Community Relations ..... 30

Policing = Only Using Police Force ..... 31

Impacts: Crime Bad ..... 32

Gendered Crime ..... 33

.Hate Crimes ..... 35

Crime Race ..... 36

Crime Economy ..... 38

Organized Crime Bad..... 41

Impacts: Solvency Circumvention ..... 43

State of Exception ..... 44

DOJ Fails ..... 45

Police Unions..... 46

Civilian review boards ..... 48

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

Reform fails – empirical ..... 49

Organizational Culture ..... 50

Discretion ..... 52

Backsliding..... 54

Political Backlash..... 56

Police backlash ..... 58

Forensic Science ..... 59

Prosecutors ..... 60

Neg Broken Window Policing..... 61

Answers to Case ..... 62

Answers to Inherency..... 63

Answers to Punishment ..... 64

Answers to Black Lives Matter ..... 67

Answers to Sex Work ..... 69

Answers to Trans Rights..... 71

Answers to Gentrification ..... 73

Answers to Solvency ..... 75

Disadvantage Links..... 78

Crime DA Links ..... 79

Crime DA Ext – A2: Evidence Press ..... 82

Politics Links ..... 84

Kritik Links ..... 86

Security Links..... 87

Capitalism Links..... 88

Carceral Humanism Links ..... 90

Neg Mandatory Minimums ..... 92

Inherency – Incarceration is declining now ..... 93

AD1 Answers – Racial Inequality ..... 95

White offenders have longer sentences and are less likely to receive relief from mandatory minimums.... 96

Sentencing guidelines are worse ..... 97

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

“Sentence lengths are racialized” answers ..... 99

AD2 Answers – Prosecutorial Discretion..... 100

Safety valve policies solve for low-level offenders ..... 101

Judicial discretion is worse..... 102

Case Turns ..... 106

Crime rates ..... 107

Cooperation with law enforcement ..... 109

Counterplans ..... 111

Fentanyl PIC..... 112

Plea Bargains ..... 114

Drug decriminalization ..... 116

Rehabilitation programs..... 118

K links ..... 119

Neg Prisons Abolition ..... 121

Extra Topicality ..... 122

AT: Prisons Increase Recidivism ..... 124

AT: Profit Over People/Private Prisons ..... 129

Education CP ..... 134

Education Solves Profit Over People..... 135

Education Solves Intersectional Violence ..... 137

Avoids Politics ..... 139

Unionization CP ..... 140

Surveillance CP ..... 141

Gradual Re-Entry CP ..... 143

Generic CPs ..... 144

Solvency ..... 145

Avoids Politics ..... 146

Politics Links ..... 147

Neg Qualified Immunity ..... 148

Depolicing DA..... 149

**We’re a small non-profit. Please don’t share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)**

Courts Backlog DA ..... 152

Congress CP ..... 154

Congress extension ..... 156

Courts not modeled ..... 158

Lower Courts CP ..... 160

Accountability frontline..... 161

Rights frontline..... 163

Anticipatory policing good ..... 165

A2 Deters legitimate lawsuits ..... 167

A2 Prevents reform ..... 169

A2 Poor police training..... 170

A2 Clearly established bad ..... 171

A2 Excessive reasonableness bad ..... 173

A2 Unconstitutional ..... 174

A2 Assess after discovery ..... 176

Neg Voting Enfranchisement ..... 177

Federalism Links ..... 178

Federalism Links ..... 179

States Counterplan: States Solve Better ..... 180

States Counterplan: Solvency ..... 181

PICs/Exclusion CP Solvency ..... 182

Courts Counterplan Solvency ..... 183

Politics Links ..... 184

Movements: Uniqueness ..... 185

Movements: Links ..... 186

Movements Solvency ..... 187

Movements Solvency ..... 188

Movements Solvency ..... 189

Abolition Counterplan/Kritik Solvency..... 190

Abolition Counterplan/Kritik: Reformism Bad ..... 191

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

Genealogy/General Kritik Links.....	192
Constitution Answers.....	193
Racism Answers.....	194
Democracy Answers.....	195
General Case Answers.....	196
CP States Counterplan.....	197
States Counterplan Negative.....	198
States Counterplan 1NC Shell 1 of 2.....	199
States Counterplan 1NC Shell 2 of 2.....	200
States Better on Criminal Justice.....	202
States Better on Crime: Counterterrorism Links.....	203
States CP: Federal Control Causes Solvency Rollbacks.....	204
States CP: Federal Control Causes Solvency Rollbacks.....	205
States CP: Federal Control Causes Solvency Rollbacks.....	206
States CP: Federal Control Undermines CJS.....	207
States CP: Interstate Compacts Solve--Criminal Justice.....	208
States CP: Interstate Compacts Solve.....	209
States CP: Interstate Compacts Solve.....	210
States CP: Fiat Power & Interstate Compacts Theory.....	211
Answers to "Interstate Compacts Require Federal Approval".....	212
Answers to "Interstate Compacts Upset Balance of Power".....	213
States Counterplan: Federal CJS Can't Solve.....	214
Answers to Permutations.....	215
Answers to "States Bad for Rights" Arguments.....	216
Answers to "States Govern Poorly".....	217
Answers to "States Violate Rights".....	218
CP Supreme Court Counterplan.....	219
File Description.....	220
1NC – Death Penalty (Roane v Barr).....	221
Extensions.....	224

1NC – Juvenile Life w/o Parole (Jones v Mississippi) ..... 232

Extensions ..... 234

1NC – Mandatory Minimums (Borden v US)..... 240

Extensions ..... 242

Net Benefit (PTX, Federalism) ..... 245

Generic Solvency Extensions..... 249

DA Depolicing Disadvantage ..... 254

1NC ..... 255

2NC Extension ..... 258

Depolicing is real ..... 261

Link—Generic ..... 268

Link—Evidentiary restrictions ..... 272

Link – Legal reform/qualified immunity..... 274

Link – BWCs ..... 277

Depolicing causes crime ..... 279

Economic growth impact ..... 281

Active policing good ..... 282

Depolicing lowers officer quality..... 284

Police department culture key..... 287

A2 Public/minority distrust outweighs ..... 288

A2 Community policing better ..... 290

A2 No crime increase ..... 291

A2 Public distrust is more significant ..... 292

DA Fear of Crime Disadvantage ..... 293

1NC—UQ..... 294

1NC—Link..... 295

1NC—Internal Link ..... 296

1NC—Impact ..... 297

1NC—Impact ..... 298

Extensions ..... 299

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

Uniqueness – Public Fear of Crime Low .....	300
Uniqueness – Public Fear of Crime Low .....	301
Uniqueness—Authoritarianism Low Now .....	302
Uniqueness—Authoritarianism Low Now .....	303
Uniqueness—Authoritarianism Low Now .....	304
Uniqueness—Democracy High Now .....	305
Uniqueness—Democracy High Now .....	306
Link—Criminal Justice Reform .....	307
Link—Criminal Justice Reform .....	308
Link—Criminal Justice Reform .....	309
Link—Policing Reform—A/T Support for Reform .....	310
Link—Policing Reform .....	311
Link—Policing Reform .....	312
Link—Policing Reform .....	313
Link—Abolishing the Death Penalty .....	314
Link—Abolishing the Death Penalty .....	315
Link—Mandatory Minimums .....	316
Link—Mandatory Minimums .....	317
Link—Abolishing Prisons/ Mass Incarceration .....	318
Link—Abolishing Prisons/ Mass Incarceration .....	319
Link—Abolishing Prisons/ Mass Incarceration .....	320
Internal Link—Framing .....	321
Internal Link—A/T “Crime Rates Falling” .....	322
Internal Link—Shapes Laws/Government .....	323
Internal Link—Congress Signaling .....	324
Internal Link—US AG Signaling .....	325
Internal Link—Perception of Crime .....	326
Internal Link—Shapes Policy .....	327
Internal Link—Perception of Criminals .....	328
Internal Link—Fear of Crime Causes Authoritarianism .....	329

***We’re a small non-profit. Please don’t share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

Internal Link—Fear of Crime Cause Authoritarianism .....	330
Impact—Magnifier .....	331
Impact—Framing.....	332
Impact—Authoritarianism Crushes Democracy.....	333
Impact – Authoritarianism = Domestic Terrorism .....	334
Impact – Authoritarianism = Domestic Terrorism .....	335
Impact – Authoritarianism = Structural Racism .....	336
Impact – Authoritarianism = Social Intolerance/Racism.....	337
Impact – Authoritarianism = Violence .....	338
Impact—Authoritarianism= Root Cause of Impacts .....	340
Impact—Fear of Crime Bad .....	341
A/T COVID .....	342
A/T COVID .....	343
A/T “Plan Reduces Crime” .....	344
A/T Cost Savings Makes Plan Popular .....	345
DA Federalism Disadvantage .....	346
Federalism Disadvantage: 1NC Shell.....	347
Federalism: Uniqueness .....	349
Federalism: Uniqueness .....	350
Federalism: Links.....	351
Federalism: Links.....	352
Federalism: Link Multiplier.....	353
Federalism Impacts: Power Grid .....	354
Federalism Impacts: Power Grid .....	356
Federalism Impacts: Power Grid .....	357
Federalism Impacts: Democracy .....	358
Federalism Impacts: Turns Case.....	359
Federalism Addresses Racism/Protects Minority Rights .....	361
Federalism improves policymaking.....	362
Federalism Impacts: Economic Growth .....	363

K Abolition Kritik.....	364
File Description.....	365
1NC Shell .....	366
Links.....	370
Politics of Reform .....	371
Transformation of Control .....	374
Manufacturing Deviancy .....	383
Disciplinary Power Focus.....	385
Policing .....	386
2NC Extensions.....	387
A2: Perm.....	388
Extensions: Framework/Thesis .....	391
Extensions: Alternative .....	395
K Biopolitics Kritik.....	403
1NC Shell .....	404
2NC Extensions.....	407
Framing .....	408
Subjectivity first.....	409
Links.....	411
Forensic science .....	412
DNA evidence .....	415
Policing – General.....	419
Police training.....	423
Rehabilitation .....	424
Drug sentencing .....	427
Impacts.....	429
Alt/Solvency .....	433
Answers to perm .....	437
Reform fails .....	438
K Capitalism Kritik .....	441

1NC Shell .....	442
Links.....	445
General.....	446
Broken Windows .....	449
Prison Abolition.....	451
Prison Slavery/Labor .....	455
Private Prisons.....	457
Predictive Policing .....	460
Critical Race .....	463
Impacts.....	467
Prison Industrial Complex .....	468
Value to Life .....	469
War.....	470
Laundry List .....	473
Alternatives .....	474
Revolutionary Consciousness.....	475
Marxist Methodology.....	477
K Feminist Kritik.....	479
1NC.....	480
1NC Legalism Shell .....	481
1NC Legalism Shell .....	482
Links.....	483
Criminal Justice System – General Links (Reforms) .....	484
Criminal Justice System – General Links .....	485
Criminal Justice System – Exclusion / Access Links .....	487
Criminal Justice System – Women in the System Links .....	488
Sentencing Reform Links.....	489
Constitution Links.....	490
The State / Government Links.....	491
The State / Government Links.....	493

***We're a small non-profit. Please don't share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

A2: Link Turns..... 494

Impacts..... 495

General / Extinction ..... 496

Alternative Extension ..... 498

Solvency Extension – Feminist Critical Policy Analysis..... 499

Solvency Extension – Feminist Critical Policy Analysis..... 501

Solvency Extension – Gender is Key..... 502

A2: No Blueprint..... 503

A2: Permutations ..... 504

No Solvency / Turns ..... 505

No Solvency / Decenters Gender ..... 506

Mutually Exclusive / No Solvency..... 507

Reductionism Turn ..... 509

Assimilation Turns / No Solvency..... 510

Answers & General Extension ..... 512

Framework Extension..... 513

A2: You’re White Feminism..... 514

A2: Right Wing Backlash..... 515

A2: Right Wing Backlash..... 516

**Resolved: The United States federal government should enact substantial criminal justice reform in the United States in one or more of the following: forensic science, policing, sentencing.**

## **Impacts: Crime Bad**

## Gendered Crime

### **Domestic violence is the most prolific and under reported type of violence; it is gendered and is increasing due to COVID-19's social distancing policies**

Melissa **Godin**, Godin Journalist for *Time*, **March 18**, 2020, "As Cities Around the World Go on Lockdown, Victims of Domestic Violence Look for a Way Out", <https://time.com/5803887/coronavirus-domestic-violence-victims/> (accessed: 05/19/20)

For people who are experiencing domestic violence, mandatory lockdowns to curb the spread of COVID-19 (the disease caused by the new coronavirus) have trapped them in their homes with their abusers, isolated from the people and the resources that could help them. In the United States, where 5,218 people have been infected with the coronavirus, the National Domestic Violence Hotline reports that a growing number of callers say that their abusers are using COVID-19 as a means of further isolating them from their friends and family. "Perpetrators are threatening to throw their victims out on the street so they get sick," Katie Ray-Jones, the CEO of the National Domestic Violence Hotline tells TIME. "We've heard of some withholding financial resources or medical assistance." From Europe to Asia, millions of people have been placed under lockdown, as the coronavirus infects more than 183,000 people. But Anita Bhatia, the Deputy Executive Director of the United Nations Women tells TIME that "the very technique we are using to protect people from the virus can perversely impact victims of domestic violence." She added that "while we absolutely support the need to follow these measures of social distancing and isolation, we also recognize that it provides an opportunity for abusers to unleash more violence." One out of three women in the world experience physical or sexual violence in their lifetime, according to the World Health Organization, making it "the most widespread but among the least reported human rights abuses." While men experience domestic violence, women make up the majority of victims, with LGBTQ individuals also facing elevated rates of domestic violence. But during times of crisis—such as natural disasters, wars, and epidemics—the risk of gender-based-violence escalates. In China, the number of domestic violence cases reported to the local police tripled in February compared to the previous year, according to Axios. Activists say this is a result of enforced lockdown.

## Domestic violence is invisible and is rising under COVID-19

**The Economist, April 22, 2020**, “Domestic violence has increased during coronavirus lockdowns”, <https://www.economist.com/graphic-detail/2020/04/22/domestic-violence-has-increased-during-coronavirus-lockdowns> (accessed: 05/19/20)

WITH HALF the world’s population under some form of lockdown to slow the spread of covid-19, most activities have been dramatically curtailed, including illegal ones. Official figures suggest that crime has plummeted in many big cities. Violent crime, including murder, rape and assault, has fallen even more sharply. But as lockdowns began, campaigners sounded warnings that domestic violence—a crime committed in private, in people’s homes—would become more, not less, frequent. Those fears appear to have been borne out. An analysis by The Economist of data from five big American cities indicates that although most types of crime have indeed fallen in recent weeks, reports of domestic violence have increased. Sifting through over 100,000 reports from police departments in Chicago, Kansas City, Los Angeles, Memphis and New Orleans, which all went into lockdown between March 19th and 24th, we estimate that total crime soon fell by 25%, compared with the week ending on March 1st. However, reports of domestic violence increased by 5%. (Because crimes follow a marked weekly pattern, our chart shows seven-day averages.) How far this reflects the true picture is unclear. In normal times, crimes are often reported well after the fact. Even then, it can take time for them to be processed and show up in official statistics. In Chicago, for instance, one in ten alleged crimes recorded in January and February had taken place more than a week before. This delay means that reported crime falls the closer it comes to the present day. (Our chart has a dotted line for the last 14 days of available data to indicate this effect.) In these abnormal times, the lag may be longer, as police officers struggle to impose lockdowns while trying to avoid contracting the disease. In Chicago, hundreds of officers have been diagnosed with covid-19; three have died. Domestic violence is thought to be one of the most under-reported crimes. In lockdown, it may be even more so. Forced to stay with a violent family member or partner, it may be more difficult, if not dangerous, for victims to seek help when the abuser is always around. Data provided by Denmark’s national domestic-violence hotline, Lev Uden Vold (Life Without Violence), show that in the week after the country’s lockdown began, total call volumes fell by 15%, while calls about emergency shelters—typically from people asking for a place to stay immediately—rose sharply

## **.Hate Crimes**

### **Hate crimes are at a 16-year high; the majority of which are the most serious and violence forms**

Sam **Levin**, Levin is a LA Correspondent for *The Guardian*, November 12, **2019**, “Violent hate crimes in US reach highest levels in 16 years, FBI reports” <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2019/nov/12/hate-crimes-2018-latinos-transgender-fbi> (accessed: 05/19/20)

Violent hate crimes and threats have reached their highest levels in the US in 16 years, with a surge in attacks against Latinos and transgender people in 2018, according to new FBI data. The data comes from more than 16,000 law enforcement agencies. Overall, the agencies reported a slight decrease in total hate crime reports, which include crimes against property, from 7,175 incidents in 2017 to 7,120 last year. But the number of reports of hate crimes against people, increased from 4,090 to 4,571, a roughly 12% jump. In other words, the most serious and violent forms of hate crimes are increasing to dramatic levels, said Brian Levin, the director for the Center for the Study of Hate and Extremism, who analyzed the data.

### **People of color at the most likely to be the victim of a hate crime and disenfranchises racial minorities**

Frederick **Rivara**, Monica **Vavilala**, and Ali **Rowhani-Rahbar**, Rivara is professor and vice chair of Academic Affairs at the UW Department of Pediatrics, Vavilala is a UW professor of Anesthesiology and Pediatrics and director of HIPRC and Rowhani-Rahbar is the Bartley Dobb Professor for the Study and Prevention of Violence and associate professor at the UW Department of Epidemiology January 08, **2019**, “BLACKS, MINORITIES DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPACTED BY HATE CRIMES” <https://epi.washington.edu/news/blacks-minorities-disproportionately-impacted-hate-crimes> (accessed: 05/19/20)

Hispanic and Black populations have a higher risk of becoming victims of race- or ethnicity- motivated violent hate crimes compared to non-Hispanic Whites (Whites), according to a new study from the University of Washington (UW) that looked at the risk and health impacts of these types of crimes. Model estimates of victimization for Blacks ranged from 30 to 40 percent higher, and 10 to 60 percent higher for Hispanics. These crimes against Blacks tended to be more violent, usually involving a weapon or firearm, and resulted in higher rates of injuries and medical care compared to other races and ethnic groups. Furthermore, the downstream effects of these crimes, such as emotional injury and psychological trauma, have a bigger impact on Black victims’ personal life, work or school over time. The study found that nearly 40 percent of Blacks reported difficulties at school or work after the hate crime juxtaposed to 21.5 percent of White and 11.7 percent of Hispanic victims. “The society we live in has a bias that disenfranchises minorities and people of color,” said Robert Tessler M.D., M.P.H., who led this study as a Master’s student in the UW Department of Epidemiology. “This study provides some objective data supporting that claim.”

## **Impacts: Solvency Circumvention**

## State of Exception

### **Police exist in a state of exception – they can't be checked by the law or the constitution.**

Nirej **Sekhon**, Associate Professor of Law, Georgia State University College of Law, POLICE AND THE LIMIT OF LAW, Columbia Law Review 119:6, October **2019**, <https://columbialawreview.org/content/police-and-the-limit-of-law/>, Accessed May 11, 2020

Below, this Essay argues that the theoretical framework of “sovereignty” offers a more accurate descriptive account of the municipal police than a legality-based account can. Sovereignty also explains why legality cannot achieve more than an ambivalent relation with the municipal police. Section II.A leads into a theoretical exposition on sovereignty by first illustrating how Fourth Amendment doctrine on excessive force reveals legality’s ambivalence toward the police. Police violence is constitutional if it is reasonably in the service of a discrete crime-control goal. 229 and accompanying text. By casting violence as incidental to crime control, constitutional doctrine obfuscates violence’s centrality to defining police authority. It is the threat of violence that may be inflicted without an external check that defines police status and authority, 230. particularly in low-income, minority communities. 231 Section II.B draws on police sociology and urban ethnography to construct a typology of police violence that reveals both its intensity and pervasiveness. Much of this violence is, technically speaking, unconstitutional. 232. But formal and practical constraints ensure that aggrieved individuals cannot bring constitutional claims. 233. This means that even though constitutional excessive force principles may apply, they have little effect. This situation describes what constitutional and political theorist Carl Schmitt termed a “state of exception.” 234. Section II.C argues that the police operate in a state of exception, functioning as “street sovereigns” whose authority can neither be subsumed by legality nor, surprisingly, be wholly divorced from it either. Section II.D uses the street sovereign theory to make sense of plainclothes policing and, in so doing, anticipates criticism of the theory.

## DOJ Fails

### **DOJ interventions don't reduce use of force – departments drag their heels and go back on reforms after oversight ends.**

**Kelly Et Al**, Kimbriell Kelly, Sarah Childress, Steven Rich, “What Happens When Police Are Forced to Reform?” PBS Frontline, November 13, **2015**, <https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/frontline/article/what-happens-when-police-are-forced-to-reform/> Accessed May 11, 2020

Over the past two decades, Justice has undertaken its deepest interventions at 16 departments that had patterns of excessive or deadly force, implementing reforms under the watch of independent monitors. More than its predecessors, the Obama administration has aggressively pursued police departments over the abuses, recently launching probes after individuals died as a result of encounters with police in Baltimore and Ferguson, Mo. The question is whether such interventions work. The Justice Department has not studied the long-term outcomes at the law enforcement agencies it has targeted. To examine the impact, reporters surveyed the departments, visiting four cities. They interviewed officials, federal monitors and civil rights advocates. They also reviewed use-of-force data, monitoring reports and local budgets. The reforms have led to modernized policies, new equipment and better training, police chiefs, city leaders, activists and Justice officials agree. But measured by incidents of use of force, one of Justice's primary metrics, the outcomes are mixed. In five of the 10 police departments for which sufficient data was provided, use of force by officers increased during and after the agreements. In five others, it stayed the same or declined. None of the departments completed reforms by the targeted dates, the review found. In most, the interventions have dragged years beyond original projections, driving up costs. In 13 of the police departments for which budget data was available, costs are expected to surpass \$600 million, expenses largely passed on to local taxpayers. Officer morale in some of the departments plummeted during the interventions, according to interviews. Collectively, the departments have cycled through 52 police chiefs as the agencies tried to meet federal demands. Some departments have struggled to sustain reforms once oversight ended, and in some cities, police relations with residents remain strained.

## Police Unions

### **Police and prison unions will engage in carceral clawback to circumvent any reforms.**

Marie **Gottschalk**, Professor of Poli Sci at U Penn, B.A. in history from Cornell University, an M.P.A. from Princeton University's Woodrow Wilson School, and an M.A. and Ph.D. in political science from Yale University. "Are We There Yet? The Promise, Perils and Politics of Penal Reform," Prison Legal News, January 1, **2016**, <https://www.prisonlegalnews.org/news/2016/jan/1/are-we-there-yet-promise-perils-and-politics-penal-reform/> Accessed May 11, 2020

Several factors help to explain why "carceral clawback" is so tenacious. As the carceral state has grown, so has the political clout and political acumen of groups, institutions and organizations with vested economic interests in maintaining the world's largest penal system. These vested interests were not necessarily the main catalysts for the emergence of the carceral state, but they pose major impediments to razing it. Prison guards' unions, state departments of corrections, law enforcement groups, the private corrections industry and the financial firms that devise bonds and other mechanisms to fund the carceral state all stand in the way of deep cuts to the correctional population. By deep I mean reducing today's incarceration rate of 716 per 100,000 residents to 175 (or less) per 100,000 – the level on the eve of the prison boom that began in the mid-1970s. In most elite circles, calls to cut today's incarceration rate in half to 350 per 100,000 – which would still leave the United States as the most punitive Western country by far – are considered radical and off the table.

### **Prison officer unions are powerful and engage in fierce resistance to any effort at sentencing reform or reducing mass incarceration.**

Joshua **Page**, Ph.D.: Sociology, University of California at Berkeley, Professor of Sociology @ U of Minnesota, "Prison Officer Unions and the Perpetuation of the Penal Status Quo," Criminology and Public Policy 10, no. 3 (August **2011**): 735-770 Accessed May 11, 2020

This article encourages a measured view on the prospects for extensive, long-term sentencing and prison reform capable of rolling back mass imprisonment. It argues that, in key states, prison officer unions and their allies have fiercely and effectively resisted-and will likely continue to resist-major efforts to downsize prisons. "Downsizing" is more than "decarceration," or the reduction of a penal population.<sup>2</sup> It also includes shedding prisons and related carceral infrastructure, reducing workforces, and slashing spending. I show that the California Correctional Peace Officers Association (CCPOA) grew alongside the prison population, becoming an effective and powerful union. As it gained members, wealth, and political capital, the CCPOA became an influential actor within a coalition of actors that props up mass imprisonment, even as state leaders attempt to decrease the state's penal system.

## Police unions circumvent and block reforms.

James **Surowiecki**, "Why Are Police Unions Blocking Reform?" *The New Yorker*, September 12, **2016**, <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2016/09/19/why-are-police-unions-blocking-reform> Accessed May 11, 2020

For the past fifty years, police unions have done their best to block policing reforms of all kinds. In the seventies, they opposed officers' having to wear name tags. More recently, they've opposed the use of body cameras a, malpractice, it's a matter of public record, but, in much of the country, a police officer's use of excessive force is not. Across the nation, unions have led the battle to limit the power of civilian-review boards, generally by arguing that civilians are in no position to judge the split-second decisions that police officers make. Earlier this year, Newark created a civilian-review board that was acclaimed as a model of oversight. The city's police union immediately announced that it would sue to shut it down.

## Prison officer unions have power and fight every effort at criminal justice reform with effective campaigns.

Joshua **Page**, Ph.D.: Sociology, University of California at Berkeley, Professor of Sociology @ U of Minnesota, "Prison Officer Unions and the Perpetuation of the Penal Status Quo," *Criminology and Public Policy* 10, no. 3 (August **2011**): 735-770 Accessed May 11, 2020

The unions have sufficient resources to carry out their campaigns because of their size (between 20,000 and 30,000 dues-paying members), and the unions are so large because of the prison boom. In this respect, imprisonment provided the raw materials that the organizations use to resist downsizing prisons. A consequence of the prison boom, then, was the empowerment of actors with a material stake in and ideological commitment to the penal status quo. In sum, neither the CCPOA nor NYSCOPBA (or its predecessor) sparked mass imprisonment in their respective states, but the unions are now obstacles to rolling back that phenomenon. Therefore, the factors that started mass imprisonment are not necessarily the same factors that sustain it.

# **Neg Prisons Abolition**

## Extra Topicality

### A. Policing refers only to the enforcement of laws by the police and is separate from the creation of social programs and institutions

**Lexico**, Lexico is a dictionary power by Oxford, **2020**, “policing”, <https://www.lexico.com/en/definition/policing> (accessed: 04/13/20)

verb (used with object), po-lic-ed, po-lic-ing. to regulate, control, or keep in order by or as if by means of police. Military. to clean and keep clean (a camp, post, etc.)

### B. Violation: Prison abolition is extra topical because it requires a massive increase in social spending and transformation of society

Bill **Keller**, Keller is the founding editor in chief of *The Marshall Project*, June 13, **2019**, “What Do Abolitionists Really Want?”, <https://www.themarshallproject.org/2019/06/13/what-do-abolitionists-really-want>, (accessed: 04/13/20)

Five years ago, when the activist and cable TV host Van Jones launched the #cut50 campaign to reduce U.S. prison populations by half, many mainstream justice reform watchers rolled their eyes at what seemed to be a reckless overreach. (My own eye-roll is here.) Now the campaign has attracted an A-list of celebrities, philanthropists and candidates pursuing the Democratic presidential nomination. These days, when Jones gets pilloried, it’s as likely to be for being too compromising: Why stop short of #cut100? This story was published in collaboration with Bloomberg Opinion. People who follow criminal justice policy for a living say the fastest growing subset of the reform movement consists of abolitionists who say a system that is inherently racist and based on retribution should be pulled up by the roots. Not just prisons and jails, but most of the institutions of law enforcement and criminal justice. “Abolition has become a rallying cry for the progressive wing of the justice reform movement,” Jeremy Travis told me. “NO NEW JAILS. NO MORE MONEY FOR POLICE. ABOLISH ICE. ABOLISH PRISONS.” Travis, who oversees criminal justice issues for the Arnold Ventures philanthropy, has spent a career in the system, most recently as president of the John Jay College of Criminal Justice in New York. (Disclosure: Laura and John Arnold, the founders of Arnold Ventures, are donors to The Marshall Project, my former employer.) “There is lots of energy behind this reframing of the ‘reform’ agenda,” Travis said. Prison abolition has decades of antecedents, led by once-fringe figures like Angela Davis, the 1960s communist firebrand, and Ruth Wilson Gilmore, the subject in April of a sympathetic profile in the New York Times Magazine. More recently abolition has been embraced by younger Americans who grew up after violent crime peaked in the early 1990s, and has helped kindle some fundamental rethinking in the mainstream. Like other radical ideas—Medicare for All, the Green New Deal—abolition means different things to different people. Most of those who rally to the cause do not advocate a world where no one answers your 911 call and serial killers are set loose. **Abolition is an ideal—like, say, “repeal and replace.” The real debate is what should replace the current institutions.** “There is always going to be some role for prisons, but maybe 10 percent of what we do now,” said Martin Horn, a former New York State parole director, now a professor at John Jay. “I think we need police. We may not need as many as we now have, and we want to use them differently.” Abolitionists generally start the conversation with two immense objectives. The first is devolving responsibility for public safety to local communities. (“Civilianizing safety,” some experts call it.) One reason New York City has reduced its crime rate while simultaneously slashing arrests, incarceration and law-enforcement overreach is that the city has a nonprofit network on the ground, some of it subsidized by the city, to combat violence and to help the formerly incarcerated safely reenter society. Abolitionists’ other aim is to redistribute government spending from police and prisons to narrowing the underlying, crime-breeding inequalities of wealth and opportunity. They would instead invest in housing, education, jobs and health—a goal that seems remote in the current political environment.

### C. Standards:

1. Extra topicality bad: explodes ground much collapses fairness
  - a. Impossible to predict since aff gets to change the topic which means that even if the aff is important to discuss, it doesn’t make a good debate topic .
2. Topic Education: going outside the bounds of the resolution prevents a meaningful discussion of state responsibility onto a topic divorced from political reality

***We’re a small non-profit. Please don’t share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

**D. Voters for fairness and education**

**Evaluate under competing interpretations because reasonability is arbitrary**

## AT: Prisons Increase Recidivism

**Education programs reduce recidivism and are expanding; there are more than 65 two- and four-year institutions coordinating with the Pell grant and the federal government to provide education to inmates**

Ashley A. **Smith**, Smith covers education for *Insider Higher Ed*, November 06, **2018**, "Momentum for Prison Education", <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2018/11/06/colleges-push-more-resources-support-prison-education-programs> (accessed: 04/13/20)

Jackson College is among 65 two- and four-year institutions that are participating in the Second Chance Pell Grant program. Launched in 2015 by the Obama administration, the program gives colleges and the U.S. Department of Education flexibility to award federal aid to incarcerated students. The Trump administration supports the experiment, which is funded through 2019, and is examining how to better evaluate its results. The results could help Congress decide whether to lift the ban on federal funding, which would mean programs like the one at Sinclair could return to offering associate degrees. Cheryl Taylor, the coordinator of Sinclair's prison education programs, says the college could serve many more potential students with more funding. There are 28 prisons in the state, of which Sinclair is only in 10. Michigan does not provide funding for educating inmates, which means that prior to the Second Chance program, many convicts and their families covered the cost of tuition. The college was granted more than 1,300 Pell Grants to award to inmates as part of the federal experiment. About 600 prisoners are participating in the program, Phelan says. Lumina is funding an initiative at California's San Quentin State Prison to develop a set of benchmarks to help states and funders evaluate the best ways to educate incarcerated people. Haley Glover, strategy director for the foundation, says no helpful resources exist to identify which states fund higher education in prisons and how well states are positioned to offer funding. "There is a really vibrant community of practitioners focusing on how do they maintain and sustain these amazing programs, and they've been evaluating them all this time," she says. "There is no shortage of evidence that says they really work." Glover says policy makers and educators know anecdotally that the benefits extend beyond lowering recidivism rates, including increased earnings for families and ex-convicts who are more engaged in civic life. But research on those benefits is lacking. Sinclair's prison education program, for example, saves taxpayers more than \$33 million each year in avoided incarceration costs.

## Prison education is effective at reducing recidivism and is cost-effective

**The RAND Corporation**, August 22, **2013**, "Education and Vocational Training in Prisons Reduces Recidivism, Improves Job Outlook", <https://www.rand.org/news/press/2013/08/22.html> (accessed: 04/13/20)

Prison inmates who receive general education and vocational training are significantly less likely to return to prison after release and are more likely to find employment than peers who do not receive such opportunities, according to a new RAND Corporation report. The findings, from the largest-ever meta-analysis of correctional educational studies, suggest that prison education programs are cost effective, with a \$1 investment in prison education reducing incarceration costs by \$4 to \$5 during the first three years post-release. "We found strong evidence that correctional education plays a role in reducing recidivism," said Lois Davis, the project's lead researcher and a senior policy researcher at RAND, a nonprofit research organization. "Our findings are clear that providing inmates education programs and vocational training helps keep them from returning to prison and improves their future job prospects." Researchers found that inmates who participate in correctional education programs have 43 percent lower odds of returning to prison than those who do not. The estimate is based on studies that carefully account for motivation and other differences between correctional education recipients and non-recipients. Employment after release was 13 percent higher among prisoners who participated in either academic or vocational education programs than those who did not. Those who participated in vocational training were 28 percent more likely to be employed after release from prison than who did not receive such training. The findings also suggest that prison education programs are cost effective. The direct costs of providing education are estimated to be from \$1,400 to \$1,744 per inmate, with re-incarceration costs being \$8,700 to \$9,700 less for each inmate who received correctional education as compared to those who did not.

## Reforms are coming; education programs in prisons are effective at reducing recidivism, save \$4 for every \$1 spent, change institutional culture

Michelle **Chen**, Chen is a contributing writer for *The Nation* and a history student at the City University of New York Graduate Center, August 17, **2015**, <https://www.thenation.com/article/archive/prison-education-reduces-recidivism-by-over-40-percent-why-arent-we-funding-more-of-it/> (accessed: 04/13/20)

Though research on prison education is still lacking, studies that have tracked the relationship between recidivism and educational attainment generally point to reduced recidivism and better preparation for transition back into their communities and the workforce upon release (nearly 690,000 people walk out of prisons each year, and several million will mill through local jails). A college degree can help offset the enormous employment barriers formerly incarcerated people typically face. A 2013 RAND Corporation study showed that participation in prison education, including both academic and vocational programming, was associated with an over 40 percent reduction in recidivism—saving \$4 to \$5 for each dollar spent. But educational interventions may have more profound social impacts. Attending college classes has been associated with improved social climate and communications in the prison population, and “reduced problems with disciplinary infractions,” according to an analysis by the Institute of Higher Education Policy (IHEP). A study on women incarcerated at New York’s Bedford Hills facility was linked to improved family relationships, by demonstrating to family members a commitment to rehabilitation and turning parents into academic “role models.” This is not simply about turning inmates into good worker bees. As a formidable prison debate team in New York has shown, postsecondary education enhances critical thinking by compelling incarcerated people to channel their often prodigious street smarts into more sophisticated forms of inquiry and analysis.

## Prison reform is happening now; working conditions as well as recidivism rates are decreasing

Sarah **Shemkus**, Reporter for *The Guardian*, December 09, **2015**, “Beyond cheap labor: can prison work programs benefit inmates?”, <https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2015/dec/09/prison-work-program-ohsa-whole-foods-inmate-labor-incarceration> (accessed: 04/13/20)

In recent years, the focus of many work programs has shifted to concentrate even more on effective rehabilitation of inmates, Honeycutt said. “The transition in the last five years has been away from producing a product to producing a successful offender as our product,” she said. To that end, the association in April released a guide outlining 10 steps correctional industries programs can take to maximize the good they do for employees. The suggestions include replicating private industry conditions as closely as possible within the prison, training prison staff to manage the specific training and mentorship needs of offenders, and providing comprehensive pre-release services for inmates. Some states are already pursuing these guidelines. In North Carolina, for example, the agency Correction Enterprises works in 17 different industries; in each case, the agency partners with a formal certificate or apprentice program, allowing inmates to earn a recognized credential in fields ranging from welding to braille transcription. Efforts to connect released prisoners to jobs are also essential to a successful program, supporters say. Florida runs a transition program that helps inmates find jobs post-release, Kiminki said. More than 60% of participants in the transition program find work, she said, with an average wage of \$10 per hour. In North Carolina, Correction Enterprises staff actively recruits employers to take on released prisoners as employees.

***We’re a small non-profit. Please don’t share this file with those who have not paid including via dropbox, google drive, the web, printed copies, email, etc. Visit us at [www.wcdebate.com](http://www.wcdebate.com)***

## **Prison don't exploit labor; prison work is effective at reducing recidivism, costs, and establishing financial savings**

Sarah **Shemkus**, Reporter for *The Guardian*, December 09, **2015**, "Beyond cheap labor: can prison work programs benefit inmates?", <https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2015/dec/09/prison-work-program-ohsa-whole-foods-inmate-labor-incarceration> (accessed: 04/13/20)

Critics often point to the disparity between the low pay earned by workers and the premium prices some of these products can fetch. And some economists have suggested that paying inmates at least minimum wage would have a positive effect on the national economy, by creating more spending power and reducing recidivism. Still, even at today's wages, the high cost of security in a prison workplace eats up much of the potential profit. And in most states, the revenue from these sales is legally required to go back into improving and staffing the programs themselves. "They are not money-makers," Schwartzapfel said. Within the field of correctional industries, the Prison Industry Enhancement program employs about 5,000 people, usually in partnership with private industries who contract with the correctional system. These workers must be paid the prevailing wage for their work. For jobs like welding, the rate can range as high as \$15 per hour, said Dee Kiminki, chief administrative officer of PRIDE Enterprises, Florida's correctional industries program. Up to 80% of inmates' earnings, however, can be garnished to go toward room and board, victim restitution, child support and mandatory savings. Advocates of these programs believe working while incarcerated can teach inmates not just technical skills, but soft skills as well. Many offenders have never worked a legal job and need to learn the basics like showing up on time, listening to a supervisor and working as part of a team, said Gina Honeycutt, executive director of the National Correctional Industries Association. Among those with knowledge of the prison work system, it is generally believed that work experience helps reduce recidivism rates; several states, including Florida, California and Washington, have numbers showing that their program graduates a far less likely than average to reoffend.

## Increasing policing and prisons decreases crime rates

Toby **Helm** and Jamie **Doward**, Helm is the *Observer's* political editor and Doward is a writer at *The Guardian*, July 07, **2012**, "Longer prison terms really do cut crime, study shows", <https://www.theguardian.com/law/2012/jul/07/longer-prison-sentences-cut-crime> (accessed: 04/10/20)

The study also estimates that a policy of forcing offenders to serve a higher proportion of their sentences in prison would have a further dramatic effect on cutting crime, in part because more offenders would be behind bars for longer. If offenders were made to serve two-thirds of their sentence in custody, rather than the current half, it suggests that there would be 21,000 fewer recorded burglaries and 11,000 fewer recorded frauds in England and Wales. The findings tend to support the thrust of policies followed by the last Labour government, which increased funding to the police and concentrated on the roughly 100,000 persistent offenders responsible for a high proportion of crime. This approach increased the prison population, but it also led to reductions in overall levels of crime. By contrast, the current justice secretary, Kenneth Clarke, often questions the relationship between criminal justice policy and the level of crime and suggests that economic factors may be just as, if not more, important. Clarke has been involved in a long-running dispute with one of his Tory predecessors, Michael Howard, whose mantra that "prison works" became associated with his time at the Home Office. In 2010 Clarke questioned whether tough penal policy cut crime: "No one can prove cause and effect. The crime rate fell [under Labour], but was this the consequence of the policies of my successors as home secretary or, dare I gently hint, mine as chancellor of the exchequer at the beginning of a period of growth and strong employment? We will never know." The report says there is "unequivocal" evidence that more sustained and effective policing cuts crime. "More detection is associated with substantial reductions in crime. It plays a sustained role in preventing crime," says the study, which found that a 1% increase in the detection rate would prevent 26,000 burglaries, 85,000 thefts, 2,500 robberies and 1,800 frauds a year.

## Longer prison sentences reduce crime rates

Toby **Helm** and Jamie **Doward**, Helm is the *Observer's* political editor and Doward is a writer at *The Guardian*, July 07, **2012**, "Longer prison terms really do cut crime, study shows", <https://www.theguardian.com/law/2012/jul/07/longer-prison-sentences-cut-crime> (accessed: 04/10/20)

Tougher prison sentences reduce crime, particularly burglary, according to ground-breaking research. The study, by academics at Birmingham University, also found that during periods when police detect more offences, crime tends to fall overall, suggesting that levels of police activity – and therefore of staffing – have a direct impact on criminal activity. The findings are likely to be seized on by critics of the government's plans for reducing the number of police officers as part of spending cuts. The research, carried out for Civitas, an independent thinktank, used local sentencing data released by the Ministry of Justice under freedom of information requests to track the effectiveness of penal policy and policing on recorded crime across the 43 forces in England and Wales between 1993 and 2008. The researchers concluded that prison was particularly effective in reducing property crime when targeted at serious and repeat offenders. They concluded that an increase of just one month in the average sentence length for burglaries – from 15.4 to 16.4 months – would reduce burglaries in the following year by 4,800, out of an annual total of 962,700.